Stability and Robustness Analysis for a Multispecies Chemostat Model with Delays in the Growth Rates and Uncertainties

> Frederic Mazenc Michael Malisoff Gonzalo Robledo

Chemostat: Laboratory apparatus for continuous culture of microorganisms, with many biotechnological applications...

- Chemostat: Laboratory apparatus for continuous culture of microorganisms, with many biotechnological applications...
- Models: Represent cell or microorganism growth, wastewater treatment, or natural environments like lakes..

- Chemostat: Laboratory apparatus for continuous culture of microorganisms, with many biotechnological applications...
- Models: Represent cell or microorganism growth, wastewater treatment, or natural environments like lakes..
- States: Microorganism and substrate concentrations, prone to model uncertainties..

- Chemostat: Laboratory apparatus for continuous culture of microorganisms, with many biotechnological applications...
- Models: Represent cell or microorganism growth, wastewater treatment, or natural environments like lakes..
- States: Microorganism and substrate concentrations, prone to model uncertainties..
- Our goals: Input-to-state stabilization of equilibria that allow co-existence of species with one limiting nutrient

- Chemostat: Laboratory apparatus for continuous culture of microorganisms, with many biotechnological applications...
- Models: Represent cell or microorganism growth, wastewater treatment, or natural environments like lakes..
- States: Microorganism and substrate concentrations, prone to model uncertainties..
- Our goals: Input-to-state stabilization of equilibria that allow co-existence of species with one limiting nutrient
- > O. Bernard, D. Dochain, J. Gouze, J. Harmand, J. Monod,

- Chemostat: Laboratory apparatus for continuous culture of microorganisms, with many biotechnological applications...
- Models: Represent cell or microorganism growth, wastewater treatment, or natural environments like lakes..
- States: Microorganism and substrate concentrations, prone to model uncertainties..
- Our goals: Input-to-state stabilization of equilibria that allow co-existence of species with one limiting nutrient
- S. Pilyugin, H. Smith, P. Waltman, G. Wolkowicz,

- Chemostat: Laboratory apparatus for continuous culture of microorganisms, with many biotechnological applications...
- Models: Represent cell or microorganism growth, wastewater treatment, or natural environments like lakes..
- States: Microorganism and substrate concentrations, prone to model uncertainties..
- Our goals: Input-to-state stabilization of equilibria that allow co-existence of species with one limiting nutrient
- S. Pilyugin, H. Smith, P. Waltman, G. Wolkowicz,



Three vessels: feed bottle, culture vessel, collection vessel.



Three vessels: feed bottle, culture vessel, collection vessel.

Contents go in and out of culture vessel at constant rate $F(l^3/t)$.



Three vessels: feed bottle, culture vessel, collection vessel. Contents go in and out of culture vessel at constant rate $F(l^3/t)$. Constant culture volume $V(l^3)$.



Three vessels: feed bottle, culture vessel, collection vessel.

Contents go in and out of culture vessel at constant rate $F(l^3/t)$. Constant culture volume $V(l^3)$.

Constant input nutrient concentration s_{in} (mass/ l^3).



Three vessels: feed bottle, culture vessel, collection vessel.

Contents go in and out of culture vessel at constant rate $F(l^3/t)$. Constant culture volume $V(l^3)$.

Constant input nutrient concentration s_{in} (mass/ l^3).

rate of change of nutrient = input - washout - consumption.



Three vessels: feed bottle, culture vessel, collection vessel.

Contents go in and out of culture vessel at constant rate $F(l^3/t)$. Constant culture volume $V(l^3)$.

Constant input nutrient concentration s_{in} (mass/ l^3).

rate of change of nutrient = input - washout - consumption.

rate of change of organism = growth - washout.



Without organisms or consumption, $(Vs)'(t) = s_{in}F - s(t)F$.



Without organisms or consumption, $(Vs)'(t) = s_{in}F - s(t)F$.

s = concentration of nutrient in culture vessel.



Without organisms or consumption, $(Vs)'(t) = s_{in}F - s(t)F$.

s = concentration of nutrient in culture vessel.

Consumption: $\frac{msx}{a+s}$, $x = \text{concentration of organism } (\text{mass}/l^3)$.



Without organisms or consumption, $(Vs)'(t) = s_{in}F - s(t)F$.

s = concentration of nutrient in culture vessel.

Consumption: $\frac{msx}{a+s}$, x = concentration of organism (mass/ l^3). m = maximum growth rate (1/t). a = half-saturation constant.



Without organisms or consumption, $(Vs)'(t) = s_{in}F - s(t)F$.

s = concentration of nutrient in culture vessel.

Consumption: $\frac{msx}{a+s}$, x = concentration of organism (mass/ l^3). m = maximum growth rate (1/t). a = half-saturation constant.

$$\begin{cases} s' = (s_{in} - s)D - \frac{ms}{a+s}\frac{x}{\gamma} \\ x' = x\left(\frac{ms}{a+s} - D\right) \end{cases}$$
 (SC)



Without organisms or consumption, $(Vs)'(t) = s_{in}F - s(t)F$.

s = concentration of nutrient in culture vessel.

Consumption: $\frac{msx}{a+s}$, x = concentration of organism (mass/ l^3). m = maximum growth rate (1/t). a = half-saturation constant.

$$\begin{cases} s' = (s_{in} - s)D - \frac{ms}{a+s}\frac{x}{\gamma} \\ x' = x\left(\frac{ms}{a+s} - D\right) \end{cases}$$
 (SC)

$$\begin{cases} \dot{s}(t) = D[s_{in} - s(t)] - \sum_{i=1}^{n} \mu_i(s(t)) x_i(t) + \delta_0(t) \\ \dot{x}_i(t) = x_i(t) \mu_i(s(t - \tau_i)) + D[x_i^0 - x_i(t)] + \delta_i(t), \ 1 \le i \le n \end{cases}$$
(M)

 $\mu_i(s) = \frac{m_i s}{a_i + s}$. Equilibria: $\mathcal{E}_* = (s_*, x_{1*}, \dots, x_{n*}) \in (0, \infty) \times [0, \infty)^n$.

$$\begin{cases} \dot{s}(t) = D[s_{in} - s(t)] - \sum_{i=1}^{n} \mu_i(s(t)) x_i(t) + \delta_0(t) \\ \dot{x}_i(t) = x_i(t) \mu_i(s(t - \tau_i)) + D[x_i^0 - x_i(t)] + \delta_i(t), \ 1 \le i \le n \end{cases}$$
(M)

 $\mu_i(s) = \frac{m_i s}{a_i + s}$. Equilibria: $\mathcal{E}_* = (s_*, x_{1*}, \dots, x_{n*}) \in (0, \infty) \times [0, \infty)^n$.

Assumptions. The equilibria and disturbance bounds satisfy:

1)
$$\max_{i} \mu_{i}(s_{*}) < D < \mu_{n}(s_{in}), \ s_{in} = s_{*} + \sum_{i=1}^{n} \frac{\mu_{i}(s_{*})x_{i}^{0}}{D - \mu_{i}(s_{*})}, \ x_{i*} = \frac{Dx_{i}^{0}}{D - \mu_{i}(s_{*})}$$

2) $\delta_i(t) \in [\underline{d}_i, \overline{d}_i]$ for all *i* where $Ds_{in} + \underline{d}_0 > 0$, $\overline{d}_0 < 0.5Ds_*$, $Dx_i^0 + \underline{d}_i > 0$ for all indices $i \in \mathcal{P}$, and $\underline{d}_i = 0$ for all indices $i \in \{1, 2, ..., n\} \setminus \mathcal{P}$, where $\mathcal{P} = \{i \in \{1, 2, ..., n\} : x_i^0 > 0\}$.

$$\begin{cases} \dot{s}(t) = D[s_{in} - s(t)] - \sum_{i=1}^{n} \mu_i(s(t)) x_i(t) + \delta_0(t) \\ \dot{x}_i(t) = x_i(t) \mu_i(s(t - \tau_i)) + D[x_i^0 - x_i(t)] + \delta_i(t), \ 1 \le i \le n \end{cases}$$
(M)

 $\mu_i(s) = \frac{m_i s}{a_i + s}$. Equilibria: $\mathcal{E}_* = (s_*, x_{1*}, \dots, x_{n*}) \in (0, \infty) \times [0, \infty)^n$.

Assumptions. The equilibria and disturbance bounds satisfy:

1)
$$\max_{i} \mu_{i}(s_{*}) < D < \mu_{n}(s_{in}), \ s_{in} = s_{*} + \sum_{i=1}^{n} \frac{\mu_{i}(s_{*})x_{i}^{0}}{D - \mu_{i}(s_{*})}, \ x_{i*} = \frac{Dx_{i}^{0}}{D - \mu_{i}(s_{*})}$$

2) $\delta_{i}(t) \in [\underline{d}_{i}, \overline{d}_{i}]$ for all *i* where $Ds_{in} + \underline{d}_{0} > 0, \ \overline{d}_{0} < 0.5Ds_{*}, \ Dx_{i}^{0} + \underline{d}_{i} > 0$ for all indices $i \in \mathcal{P}$, and $\underline{d}_{i} = 0$ for all indices $i \in \{1, 2, ..., n\} \setminus \mathcal{P}$, where $\mathcal{P} = \{i \in \{1, 2, ..., n\} : x_{i}^{0} > 0\}.$

Assumption 2) maintains forward invariance of $(0,\infty)^{n+1}$ for (M).

$$\begin{cases} \dot{s}(t) = D[s_{in} - s(t)] - \sum_{i=1}^{n} \mu_i(s(t)) x_i(t) + \delta_0(t) \\ \dot{x}_i(t) = x_i(t) \mu_i(s(t - \tau_i)) + D[x_i^0 - x_i(t)] + \delta_i(t), \ 1 \le i \le n \end{cases}$$
(M)

 $\mu_i(s) = \frac{m_i s}{a_i + s}$. Equilibria: $\mathcal{E}_* = (s_*, x_{1*}, \dots, x_{n*}) \in (0, \infty) \times [0, \infty)^n$.

Assumptions. The equilibria and disturbance bounds satisfy:

1)
$$\max_{i} \mu_{i}(s_{*}) < D < \mu_{n}(s_{in}), \ s_{in} = s_{*} + \sum_{i=1}^{n} \frac{\mu_{i}(s_{*})x_{i}^{0}}{D - \mu_{i}(s_{*})}, \ x_{i*} = \frac{Dx_{i}^{0}}{D - \mu_{i}(s_{*})}$$

2) $\delta_{i}(t) \in [\underline{d}_{i}, \overline{d}_{i}]$ for all *i* where $Ds_{in} + \underline{d}_{0} > 0, \ \overline{d}_{0} < 0.5Ds_{*},$

$$Dx_i^0 + \underline{d}_i > 0$$
 for all indices $i \in \mathcal{P}$, and $\underline{d}_i = 0$ for all indices $i \in \{1, 2, ..., n\} \setminus \mathcal{P}$, where $\mathcal{P} = \{i \in \{1, 2, ..., n\} : x_i^0 > 0\}$.

Constant Controls: x_i^0 and s_{in} . x_i^0 : inputs from other chemostats.

$$\begin{cases} \dot{s}(t) = D[s_{in} - s(t)] - \sum_{i=1}^{n} \mu_i(s(t)) x_i(t) + \delta_0(t) \\ \dot{x}_i(t) = x_i(t) \mu_i(s(t - \tau_i)) + D[x_i^0 - x_i(t)] + \delta_i(t), \ 1 \le i \le n \end{cases}$$
(M)

 $\mu_i(s) = \frac{m_i s}{a_i + s}$. Equilibria: $\mathcal{E}_* = (s_*, x_{1*}, \dots, x_{n*}) \in (0, \infty) \times [0, \infty)^n$.

Assumptions. The equilibria and disturbance bounds satisfy:

1)
$$\max_{i} \mu_{i}(s_{*}) < D < \mu_{n}(s_{in}), \ s_{in} = s_{*} + \sum_{i=1}^{n} \frac{\mu_{i}(s_{*})x_{i}^{0}}{D - \mu_{i}(s_{*})}, \ x_{i*} = \frac{Dx_{i}^{0}}{D - \mu_{i}(s_{*})}$$

2) $\delta_{i}(t) \in [\underline{d}_{i}, \overline{d}_{i}]$ for all *i* where $Ds_{in} + \underline{d}_{0} > 0, \ \overline{d}_{0} < 0.5Ds_{*}, Dx_{i}^{0} + \underline{d}_{i} > 0$ for all indices $i \in \mathcal{P}$, and $\underline{d}_{i} = 0$ for all indices $i \in \{1, 2, ..., n\} \setminus \mathcal{P}$, where $\mathcal{P} = \{i \in \{1, 2, ..., n\} : x_{i}^{0} > 0\}$.

We also have an Assumption 3) with a bound $\overline{\tau}$ on the delays τ_i .

$$\begin{cases} \dot{s}(t) = D[s_{in} - s(t)] - \sum_{i=1}^{n} \mu_i(s(t))x_i(t) + \delta_0(t) \\ \dot{x}_i(t) = x_i(t)\mu_i(s(t-\tau_i)) + D[x_i^0 - x_i(t)] + \delta_i(t), \ 1 \le i \le n \end{cases}$$
(M)

$$\mu_i(s) = rac{m_i s}{a_i + s}$$
. Equilibria: $\mathcal{E}_* = (s_*, x_{1*}, \ldots, x_{n*}) \in (0, \infty) imes [0, \infty)^n$.

Reduces to Gouze-Robledo model when uncertainties δ_i and delays τ_i are 0 and usual model when the inputs $x_i^0 \ge 0$ are zero.

$$\begin{cases} \dot{s}(t) = D[s_{in} - s(t)] - \sum_{i=1}^{n} \mu_i(s(t)) x_i(t) + \delta_0(t) \\ \dot{x}_i(t) = x_i(t) \mu_i(s(t - \tau_i)) + D[x_i^0 - x_i(t)] + \delta_i(t), \ 1 \le i \le n \end{cases}$$
(M)

 $\mu_i(s) = \frac{m_i s}{a_i + s}$. Equilibria: $\mathcal{E}_* = (s_*, x_{1*}, \dots, x_{n*}) \in (0, \infty) \times [0, \infty)^n$.

Reduces to Gouze-Robledo model when uncertainties δ_i and delays τ_i are 0 and usual model when the inputs $x_i^0 \ge 0$ are zero.

Proves input-to-state stability (ISS) of the $\mathcal{E} = (s, x) - \mathcal{E}_*$ system.

$$\begin{cases} \dot{s}(t) = D[s_{in} - s(t)] - \sum_{i=1}^{n} \mu_i(s(t)) x_i(t) + \delta_0(t) \\ \dot{x}_i(t) = x_i(t) \mu_i(s(t - \tau_i)) + D[x_i^0 - x_i(t)] + \delta_i(t), \ 1 \le i \le n \end{cases}$$
(M)

 $\mu_i(s) = \frac{m_i s}{a_i + s}$. Equilibria: $\mathcal{E}_* = (s_*, x_{1*}, \dots, x_{n*}) \in (0, \infty) \times [0, \infty)^n$.

Reduces to Gouze-Robledo model when uncertainties δ_i and delays τ_i are 0 and usual model when the inputs $x_i^0 \ge 0$ are zero.

Proves input-to-state stability (ISS) of the $\mathcal{E} = (s, x) - \mathcal{E}_*$ system.

ISS on a set S means there are class \mathcal{K}_{∞} functions γ_i such that $|\mathcal{E}(t)| \leq \gamma_1(\gamma_2(|\mathcal{E}(0)|)e^{-t}) + \gamma_3(|\delta|_{[0,t]})$ for all $t \geq 0$ if $\mathcal{E}(0) \in S$.

$$\begin{cases} \dot{s}(t) = D[s_{in} - s(t)] - \sum_{i=1}^{n} \mu_i(s(t)) x_i(t) + \delta_0(t) \\ \dot{x}_i(t) = x_i(t) \mu_i(s(t - \tau_i)) + D[x_i^0 - x_i(t)] + \delta_i(t), \ 1 \le i \le n \end{cases}$$
(M)

 $\mu_i(s) = \frac{m_i s}{a_i + s}$. Equilibria: $\mathcal{E}_* = (s_*, x_{1*}, \dots, x_{n*}) \in (0, \infty) \times [0, \infty)^n$.

Reduces to Gouze-Robledo model when uncertainties δ_i and delays τ_i are 0 and usual model when the inputs $x_i^0 \ge 0$ are zero.

Proves input-to-state stability (ISS) of the $\mathcal{E} = (s, x) - \mathcal{E}_*$ system.

ISS on a set S means there are class \mathcal{K}_{∞} functions γ_i such that $|\mathcal{E}(t)| \leq \gamma_1(\gamma_2(|\mathcal{E}(0)|)e^{-t}) + \gamma_3(|\delta|_{[0,t]})$ for all $t \geq 0$ if $\mathcal{E}(0) \in S$.

 \mathcal{K}_{∞} is the set of all continuous strictly increasing unbounded functions $\gamma : [0, \infty) \rightarrow [0, \infty)$ such that $\gamma(0) = 0$.

$$\begin{cases} \dot{s}(t) = D[s_{in} - s(t)] - \sum_{i=1}^{n} \mu_i(s(t)) x_i(t) + \delta_0(t) \\ \dot{x}_i(t) = x_i(t) \mu_i(s(t - \tau_i)) + D[x_i^0 - x_i(t)] + \delta_i(t), \ 1 \le i \le n \end{cases}$$
(M)

 $\mu_i(s) = \frac{m_i s}{a_i + s}$. Equilibria: $\mathcal{E}_* = (s_*, x_{1*}, \dots, x_{n*}) \in (0, \infty) \times [0, \infty)^n$.

Reduces to Gouze-Robledo model when uncertainties δ_i and delays τ_i are 0 and usual model when the inputs $x_i^0 \ge 0$ are zero.

Proves input-to-state stability (ISS) of the $\mathcal{E} = (s, x) - \mathcal{E}_*$ system.

ISS on a set S means there are class \mathcal{K}_{∞} functions γ_i such that $|\mathcal{E}(t)| \leq \gamma_1(\gamma_2(|\mathcal{E}(0)|)e^{-t}) + \gamma_3(|\delta|_{[0,t]})$ for all $t \geq 0$ if $\mathcal{E}(0) \in S$.

 \mathcal{K}_{∞} is the set of all continuous strictly increasing unbounded functions $\gamma : [0, \infty) \to [0, \infty)$ such that $\gamma(0) = 0$. Sontag, '89.

$$\begin{cases} \dot{s}(t) = D[s_{in} - s(t)] - \sum_{i=1}^{n} \mu_i(s(t)) x_i(t) + \delta_0(t) \\ \dot{x}_i(t) = x_i(t) \mu_i(s(t - \tau_i)) + D[x_i^0 - x_i(t)] + \delta_i(t), \ 1 \le i \le n \end{cases}$$
(M)

 $\mu_i(s) = \frac{m_i s}{a_i + s}$. Equilibria: $\mathcal{E}_* = (s_*, x_{1*}, \dots, x_{n*}) \in (0, \infty) \times [0, \infty)^n$.

Reduces to Gouze-Robledo model when uncertainties δ_i and delays τ_i are 0 and usual model when the inputs $x_i^0 \ge 0$ are zero.

Theorem: Under our assumptions, for all constants $\underline{x} > 0$ and $\overline{s} \ge s_{in}$, the dynamics for the error vector $\mathcal{E} = (s, x) - \mathcal{E}_*$ satisfy ISS on the set $\mathcal{S}_{\overline{s},\underline{x}} = \{\mathcal{E} : \mathcal{E} + \mathcal{E}_* \in (0, \overline{s}] \times (0, \infty)^{n-1} \times (\underline{x}, \infty)\}.\square$

$$\begin{cases} \dot{s}(t) = D[s_{in} - s(t)] - \sum_{i=1}^{n} \mu_i(s(t)) x_i(t) + \delta_0(t) \\ \dot{x}_i(t) = x_i(t) \mu_i(s(t - \tau_i)) + D[x_i^0 - x_i(t)] + \delta_i(t), \ 1 \le i \le n \end{cases}$$
(M)

 $\mu_i(s) = \frac{m_i s}{a_i + s}$. Equilibria: $\mathcal{E}_* = (s_*, x_{1*}, \dots, x_{n*}) \in (0, \infty) \times [0, \infty)^n$.

Reduces to Gouze-Robledo model when uncertainties δ_i and delays τ_i are 0 and usual model when the inputs $x_i^0 \ge 0$ are zero.

Theorem: Under our assumptions, for all constants $\underline{x} > 0$ and $\overline{s} \ge s_{in}$, the dynamics for the error vector $\mathcal{E} = (s, x) - \mathcal{E}_*$ satisfy ISS on the set $\mathcal{S}_{\overline{s},\underline{x}} = \{\mathcal{E} : \mathcal{E} + \mathcal{E}_* \in (0, \overline{s}] \times (0, \infty)^{n-1} \times (\underline{x}, \infty)\}.\square$

Significance: Uniform persistence of all species for which $x_i^0 > 0$. ISS for arbitrarily large upper bounds \bar{d}_i on $\delta_i(t)$ for $i \ge 1$.

$$\begin{cases} \dot{s}(t) = D[s_{in} - s(t)] - \sum_{i=1}^{n} \mu_i(s(t)) x_i(t) + \delta_0(t) \\ \dot{x}_i(t) = x_i(t) \mu_i(s(t - \tau_i)) + D[x_i^0 - x_i(t)] + \delta_i(t), \ 1 \le i \le n \end{cases}$$
(M)

$$\mu_i(s) = rac{m_i s}{a_i + s}$$
. Equilibria: $\mathcal{E}_* = (s_*, x_{1*}, \ldots, x_{n*}) \in (0, \infty) imes [0, \infty)^n$.

Reduces to Gouze-Robledo model when uncertainties δ_i and delays τ_i are 0 and usual model when the inputs $x_i^0 \ge 0$ are zero.

Theorem: Under our assumptions, for all constants $\underline{x} > 0$ and $\overline{s} \ge s_{in}$, the dynamics for the error vector $\mathcal{E} = (s, x) - \mathcal{E}_*$ satisfy ISS on the set $\mathcal{S}_{\overline{s},\underline{x}} = \{\mathcal{E} : \mathcal{E} + \mathcal{E}_* \in (0, \overline{s}] \times (0, \infty)^{n-1} \times (\underline{x}, \infty)\}.\square$

Significance: Since $\underline{x} > 0$ and $\overline{s} \ge s_{in}$ are arbitrary, we get ISS properties on all of $(0, \infty)^{n+1}$ under our disturbance bounds.

Construct a function $T \in \mathcal{K}_{\infty}$ and constants $c_i > 0$ and $k_i > 0$ such that the time derivative of

$$V(\mathcal{E}) = \tilde{s} - s_* \ln\left(\frac{\tilde{s} + s_*}{s_*}\right) + \sum_{i=1}^n \frac{1}{c_i} \Psi_i(\tilde{x}_i), \text{ where}$$
$$\Psi_i(\tilde{x}_i) = \tilde{x}_i - x_{i*} \ln\left(\frac{\tilde{x}_i + x_{i*}}{x_{i*}}\right) \text{ for all } i \in \mathcal{P}$$
and $\Psi_i(\tilde{x}_i) = x_i \text{ for all } i \in \{1, 2, \dots, n\} \setminus \mathcal{P}$

along all solutions of (M) starting in any $S_{\overline{s},\underline{x}}$ with $\tau_i = 0$ satisfies

$$\frac{d}{dt}V(\mathcal{E}(t)) \leq -k_1 \left(\frac{\tilde{s}^2(t)}{s(t)} + \sum_{i=1}^n \frac{\tilde{x}_i^2(t)}{x_i(t)}\right) + k_2 |\delta|_{[0,t]}$$
(1)

for all $t \geq T(|\mathcal{E}(0)|)$, where $\tilde{x}_i = x_i - x_{i*}$ for all i and $\tilde{s} = s - s_*$.

Construct a function $T \in \mathcal{K}_{\infty}$ and constants $c_i > 0$ and $k_i > 0$ such that the time derivative of

$$V(\mathcal{E}) = \tilde{s} - s_* \ln\left(\frac{\tilde{s} + s_*}{s_*}\right) + \sum_{i=1}^n \frac{1}{c_i} \Psi_i(\tilde{x}_i), \text{ where}$$
$$\Psi_i(\tilde{x}_i) = \tilde{x}_i - x_{i*} \ln\left(\frac{\tilde{x}_i + x_{i*}}{x_{i*}}\right) \text{ for all } i \in \mathcal{P}$$
and $\Psi_i(\tilde{x}_i) = x_i \text{ for all } i \in \{1, 2, \dots, n\} \setminus \mathcal{P}$

along all solutions of (M) starting in any $S_{\bar{s},\underline{x}}$ with $\tau_i = 0$ satisfies

$$\frac{d}{dt}V(\mathcal{E}(t)) \leq -k_1 \left(\frac{\tilde{s}^2(t)}{s(t)} + \sum_{i=1}^n \frac{\tilde{x}_i^2(t)}{x_i(t)}\right) + k_2 |\delta|_{[0,t]}$$
(1)

for all $t \ge T(|\mathcal{E}(0)|)$, where $\tilde{x}_i = x_i - x_{i*}$ for all *i* and $\tilde{s} = s - s_*$. Extend this to ISS estimate on $[0, \infty)$ by a trajectory analysis.

Simulations

$$n = 2, D = 0.4, s_* = 0.5, x_1^0 = 1, x_2^0 = 0.55, s_{in} = 1.34412, \mu_1(s) = \frac{s}{5+s}, \mu_2(s) = \frac{s}{2+s}, x_{1*} = 1.29412, x_{2*} = 1.1, \tau = (0.14, 0) \delta(t) = (\delta_0(t), \delta_1(t), \delta_2(t)) = (0, -0.1 \sin(t), 0.1 \cos(t)).$$

Simulations

$$n = 2, D = 0.4, s_* = 0.5, x_1^0 = 1, x_2^0 = 0.55, s_{in} = 1.34412, \mu_1(s) = \frac{s}{5+s}, \mu_2(s) = \frac{s}{2+s}, x_{1*} = 1.29412, x_{2*} = 1.1, \tau = (0.14, 0) \delta(t) = (\delta_0(t), \delta_1(t), \delta_2(t)) = (0, -0.1 \sin(t), 0.1 \cos(t)).$$



 $x_1(t)$ and $x_2(t)$ are Green and Red Curves, Respectively. s(t) is Blue Curve. Initial State $(s(0), x_1(0), x_2(0)) = (0.2, 0.1, 1)$.

Simulations

$$n = 2, D = 0.4, s_* = 0.5, x_1^0 = 1, x_2^0 = 0.55, s_{in} = 1.34412, \mu_1(s) = \frac{s}{5+s}, \mu_2(s) = \frac{s}{2+s}, x_{1*} = 1.29412, x_{2*} = 1.1, \tau = (0.14, 0) \delta(t) = (\delta_0(t), \delta_1(t), \delta_2(t)) = (0, -0.1 \sin(t), 0.1 \cos(t)).$$



 $x_1(t)$ and $x_2(t)$ are Green and Red Curves, Respectively. s(t) is Blue Curve. Initial State $(s(0), x_1(0), x_2(0)) = (1.3, 0.2, 0.1)$.

> Chemostats play a central role in microbial ecology.

> Chemostats play a central role in microbial ecology.

> Persistence and asymptotic stability of equilibria are desirable.

- > Chemostats play a central role in microbial ecology.
- > Persistence and asymptotic stability of equilibria are desirable.
- \triangleright Gouze-Robledo showed coexistence by constant inputs x_i^0 .

- > Chemostats play a central role in microbial ecology.
- > Persistence and asymptotic stability of equilibria are desirable.
- \triangleright Gouze-Robledo showed coexistence by constant inputs x_i^0 .
- > This arises in chains of chemostats with multiple substrates.

- > Chemostats play a central role in microbial ecology.
- > Persistence and asymptotic stability of equilibria are desirable.
- \triangleright Gouze-Robledo showed coexistence by constant inputs x_i^0 .
- > This arises in chains of chemostats with multiple substrates.
- ▷ We generalized their work to prove ISS and added delays.

- > Chemostats play a central role in microbial ecology.
- > Persistence and asymptotic stability of equilibria are desirable.
- \triangleright Gouze-Robledo showed coexistence by constant inputs x_i^0 .
- > This arises in chains of chemostats with multiple substrates.
- ▷ We generalized their work to prove ISS and added delays.

Mazenc, F., G. Robledo, and M. Malisoff. Stability and robustness analysis for a multispecies chemostat model with delays in the growth rates and uncertainties. Discrete and Continuous Dynamical Systems Series B.

- > Chemostats play a central role in microbial ecology.
- > Persistence and asymptotic stability of equilibria are desirable.
- \triangleright Gouze-Robledo showed coexistence by constant inputs x_i^0 .
- > This arises in chains of chemostats with multiple substrates.
- ▷ We generalized their work to prove ISS and added delays.

Mazenc, F., G. Robledo, and M. Malisoff. Stability and robustness analysis for a multispecies chemostat model with delays in the growth rates and uncertainties. Discrete and Continuous Dynamical Systems Series B.

Thank you for your attention!

Backup Slides to Use if Time Allows or Questions Warrant

$$\begin{cases} \dot{s}(t) = D[s_{in} - s(t)] - \sum_{i=1}^{n} \mu_i(s(t))x_i(t) + \delta_0(t) \\ \dot{x}_i(t) = x_i(t)\mu_i(s(t-\tau_i)) + D[x_i^0 - x_i(t)] + \delta_i(t), \ 1 \le i \le n \end{cases}$$
(M)

 $\mu_i(s) = \frac{m_i s}{a_i + s}$. Equilibria: $\mathcal{E}_* = (s_*, x_{1*}, \dots, x_{n*}) \in (0, \infty) \times [0, \infty)^n$.

Reduces to Gouze-Robledo model when uncertainties δ_i and delays τ_i are 0 and usual model when the inputs $x_i^0 \ge 0$ are zero.

Theorem: Under our assumptions, for all constants $\underline{x} > 0$ and $\overline{s} \ge s_{in}$, the dynamics for the error vector $\mathcal{E} = (s, x) - \mathcal{E}_*$ satisfy ISS on the set $\mathcal{S}_{\overline{s},\underline{x}} = \{\mathcal{E} : \mathcal{E} + \mathcal{E}_* \in (0, \overline{s}] \times (0, \infty)^{n-1} \times (\underline{x}, \infty)\}.\square$

Significance: Since $\underline{x} > 0$ and $\overline{s} \ge s_{in}$ are arbitrary, we get ISS properties on all of $(0, \infty)^{n+1}$ under our disturbance bounds.

Construct a function $T \in \mathcal{K}_{\infty}$ and constants $c_i > 0$ and $k_i > 0$ such that the time derivative of

$$V(\mathcal{E}) = \tilde{s} - s_* \ln\left(\frac{\tilde{s} + s_*}{s_*}\right) + \sum_{i=1}^n \frac{1}{c_i} \Psi_i(\tilde{x}_i), \text{ where}$$
$$\Psi_i(\tilde{x}_i) = \tilde{x}_i - x_{i*} \ln\left(\frac{\tilde{x}_i + x_{i*}}{x_{i*}}\right) \text{ for all } i \in \mathcal{P}$$
and $\Psi_i(\tilde{x}_i) = x_i \text{ for all } i \in \{1, 2, \dots, n\} \setminus \mathcal{P}$

along all solutions of (M) starting in any $S_{\overline{s},\underline{x}}$ with $\tau_i = 0$ satisfies

$$\frac{d}{dt}V(\mathcal{E}(t)) \leq -k_1 \left(\frac{\tilde{s}^2(t)}{s(t)} + \sum_{i=1}^n \frac{\tilde{x}_i^2(t)}{x_i(t)}\right) + k_2 |\delta|_{[0,t]}$$
(1)

for all $t \ge T(|\mathcal{E}(0)|)$, where $\tilde{x}_i = x_i - x_{i*}$ for all *i* and $\tilde{s} = s - s_*$. Extend this to ISS estimate on $[0, \infty)$ by a trajectory analysis.

Build $T \in \mathcal{K}_{\infty}$ and positive constants \mathcal{M}_* , v_0 , and \overline{N} such that

$$V^{\sharp}(\tilde{s}_{t}, \tilde{\alpha}(t)) = V(\tilde{s}(t), \tilde{\alpha}(t)) + \mathcal{M}_{*} \int_{t-\overline{\tau}}^{t} \int_{\ell}^{t} \frac{\tilde{s}^{2}(r)}{s(r)} \mathrm{d}r \,\mathrm{d}\ell$$
 (2)

satisfies

$$\overbrace{V^{\sharp}(\tilde{s}_{t},\tilde{\alpha}(t))}^{\xi(\tilde{s}_{t},\tilde{\alpha}(t))} \leq -v_{0}\left(\frac{\tilde{s}^{2}(t)}{s(t)} + \sum_{i=1}^{n} \frac{\tilde{\alpha}_{i}^{2}(t)}{\alpha_{i}(t)} + \int_{t-\overline{\tau}}^{t} \int_{\ell}^{t} \frac{\tilde{s}^{2}(r)}{s(r)} \mathrm{d}r \, \mathrm{d}\ell\right) + \bar{N}|\delta|_{[0,t]}$$

along all solutions of the $(\tilde{s}, \tilde{\alpha})$ system for all $t \geq T(|\mathcal{E}(0)|)$ where

$$\alpha_i(t) = \mathbf{x}_i(t) \mathbf{e}^{\int_{t-\tau_i}^t [\mu_i(s(\ell)) - \mu_i(s_*)] d\ell}$$
(3)

for all *i*, *V* is the Lyapunov construction from the undelayed case, $\tilde{s} = s - s_*$ is as before, and $\tilde{\alpha}_i = \alpha_i - x_{i*}$ and $\tau_i \leq \overline{\tau}$ for all *i*.

> Chemostats play a central role in microbial ecology.

- > Persistence and asymptotic stability of equilibria are desirable.
- \triangleright Gouze-Robledo showed coexistence by constant inputs x_i^0 .
- > This arises in chains of chemostats with multiple substrates.
- ▷ We generalized their work to prove ISS and added delays.

Mazenc, F., G. Robledo, and M. Malisoff. Stability and robustness analysis for a multispecies chemostat model with delays in the growth rates and uncertainties. Discrete and Continuous Dynamical Systems Series B.

Thank you for your attention!















> Chemostats play a central role in microbial ecology.

- > Persistence and asymptotic stability of equilibria are desirable.
- \triangleright Gouze-Robledo showed coexistence by constant inputs x_i^0 .
- > This arises in chains of chemostats with multiple substrates.
- ▷ We generalized their work to prove ISS and added delays.

Mazenc, F., G. Robledo, and M. Malisoff. Stability and robustness analysis for a multispecies chemostat model with delays in the growth rates and uncertainties. Discrete and Continuous Dynamical Systems Series B.

Thank you for your attention!

References with Hyperlinked Paper Titles

Mazenc, F., G. Robledo, and M. Malisoff, "Stability and robustness analysis for a multispecies chemostat model with delays in the growth rates and uncertainties," *Discrete and Continuous Dynamical Systems Series B*, to appear.

Mazenc, F., J. Harmand, and M. Malisoff, "Stabilization in a chemostat with sampled and delayed measurements and uncertain growth functions," *Automatica*, Volume 78, April 2017, pp. 241-249.

Karafyllis, I., M. Malisoff, and M. Krstic, "Sampled-data feedback stabilization of age-structured chemostat models," in *Proceedings of the 2015 American Control Conference (Chicago, IL, 1-3 July 2015)*, pp. 4549-4554.

References with Hyperlinked Paper Titles

Mazenc, F., and M. Malisoff, "Stability and stabilization for models of chemostats with multiple limiting substrates," *Journal of Biological Dynamics*, Volume 6, Issue 2, 2012, pp. 612-627.

Mazenc, F., and M. Malisoff, "Strict Lyapunov function constructions under LaSalle conditions with an application to Lotka-Volterra systems," *IEEE Transactions on Automatic Control*, Volume 55, Issue 4, April 2010, pp. 841-854.

Mazenc, F., M. Malisoff, and J. Harmand, "Further results on stabilization of periodic trajectories for a chemostat with two species," *IEEE Transactions on Automatic Control*, Volume 53, Special Issue on Systems Biology, January 2008, pp. 66-74.

References with Hyperlinked Paper Titles

Mazenc, F., and M. Malisoff, "Stability and stabilization for models of chemostats with multiple limiting substrates," *Journal of Biological Dynamics*, Volume 6, Issue 2, 2012, pp. 612-627.

Mazenc, F., and M. Malisoff, "Strict Lyapunov function constructions under LaSalle conditions with an application to Lotka-Volterra systems," *IEEE Transactions on Automatic Control*, Volume 55, Issue 4, April 2010, pp. 841-854.

Mazenc, F., M. Malisoff, and J. Harmand, "Further results on stabilization of periodic trajectories for a chemostat with two species," *IEEE Transactions on Automatic Control*, Volume 53, Special Issue on Systems Biology, January 2008, pp. 66-74.